Electronic Supporting Information (ESI)

When defects become 'dynamic': Halide Perovskites: a new window on Materials?

Yevgeny Rakita, Igor Lubomirsky, David Cahen david.cahen@weizmann.ac.il, jgor.lubomirsky@weizmann.ac.il, yevgev@gmail.com

> Materials and Interfaces Dept., Weizmann Institute of Science, Rehovot, 76100, Israel

Footnote comments:

- *i*. This is in addition to intrinsic properties, such as arrangement of atoms and its symmetry (i.e., structure), and nature of bonding between atoms.
- *ii.* Formation of defect-pairs, which do not affect the net carrier concentration, is another option. Such doping compensation should manifest itself in a positive, rather than negative, temperature-dependence of the mobility and not only in phonon-scattering dominated regimes.¹ However, if defects cancel or neutralize each other, but still are present in high concentration, this manifests itself in a temperature-independent mobility at low temperatures, which has not (yet) been observed for HaPs.^{2,3}
- *iii.* In this analysis we use ΔG_r for the material's free energy of formation in a *reaction from constituents* that are not the elements, but which has the lowest free energy from among other possible constituent combinations and processes. ΔG_f is reserved for *formation from the elements*.
- *iv.* There are other, energetically more demanding, but possible degradation paths:^{4–6}

$$\begin{split} Eq.(i) & CH_{3}NH_{3}PbX_{3(s)} \rightarrow PbX_{2(s)} + HX_{(g)} + CH_{3}NH_{2(g)} &; \Delta G_{r} = 125\frac{kJ}{mol} \\ Eq.(ii) & CH_{3}NH_{3}PbX_{3(s)} \rightarrow PbX_{2(s)} + CH_{3}X_{(g)} + NH_{3(g)} &; \Delta G_{r} = 90\frac{kJ}{mol} \\ & CH_{3}NH_{3}PbX_{3(s)} \rightarrow PbX_{2(s)} + CH_{3}NH_{2(g)} + \frac{1}{2}H_{2(g)} + \frac{1}{2}X_{2(s,l,g)} &; \Delta G_{r} = 264\frac{kJ}{mol} \\ & \Delta G_{r} = 6 + MAPN L + 200V \end{split}$$

 G_r refers to MAPbI₃ at 300K.

v. At 300K, $1 \cdot k_B T \approx 2.5 \ kJ/mol = 26 \ meV$.

$$350 \frac{J}{J}$$

vi. The actual value for $S_r (\sim mol \cdot K)^5$ is very high for what is, based on X-ray and neutron diffraction and optical absorption and emission data, a well-ordered solid and more akin to that of dynamic systems like liquids than to (statically) ordered solids.⁷ The high entropy values can be attributed to the vibrational and configurational degrees of freedom, which clearly are higher here than in 'classical' semiconductors.^{8,9} The difference can be ascribed to the higher coordination numbers between atoms in the structure, to which corner-sharing of coordination octahedra, enabling the octahedra to tilt and rotate, should be added. While to some extent HaPs seem similar to polymers, especially proteins, which are also dynamically disordered, proteins lack the static order of the former.⁵

- *vii.* CuInSe₂ (and possibly other chalcopyrites), like HaPs, is another potential composition with $\Delta G_r \sim (few) \cdot k_B T$ for decomposition to binaries (CuSe₂ and In₂Se₃). Despite the low ΔG_r , the activation energy for ion diffusion in CuInSe₂ is large enough to allow kinetically-stabilized defects, in contrast to the case of HaPs. This point is further discussed later in the main text.
- This range for ΔH^{defect}_{f} in HaPs fits the range of Shockley defect formation energy in PbBr₂ of V_{Br} (viii. $\Delta H_{f}^{point} \sim 160 \text{ kJ/mol}$), the only direct experimental value available (known to us) for Pb-X systems.
- ix. Schottky or Frenkel defect formation energies for stiff materials^{7,10} such as oxide perovskites¹¹ are $300\frac{kJ}{mol}$. Solid halides typically have much lower ΔH^{defect}_{f} (~ $70 - 150\frac{kJ}{mol}$ at room usually >

temperature)^{12,7,10} which, to a first approximation, can be explained by the decreased Coulomb lattice (Madelung) energy, which scales with the effective charge on the anion.¹³ Following the similarities in the defect activation energies in Pb-based halides and, because no radioactive isotope tracing studies

have as yet been reported for Pb HaPs, $\Delta H_{f}^{defect}(PbBr_{2}) \sim 160 \frac{kJ}{mol}$ is the only value that can be used to give an idea of the *point* defect formation energy in HaPs (which is named in Figure 2(ii) as ΔH^{defect}_{f}).

$$N_{(sites)} = \frac{N}{a^3} \gg n_{eq}$$

- x. This relation can be used in the limit where , which is, generally, true $\left(\frac{N}{r^3} \sim 2 \cdot 10^{22} \text{ defect sites}\right).$
- The 'self healing' experiments were done inside crystals, using 2-photon excitation, i.e., no mass change xi. occurs. 1-photon excitation of the surface resulted in irreversible degradation (more so if the A cation was a volatile organic), because of a driving force for change via the law of mass action.
- *xii.* From the similarity between the ionic conductivity from impedance and Br-isotope tracer measurements, it was concluded that σ_{ionic} is due to the halide. Impedance analyses on CsPbBr₃ and CuPbBr₃^{14,15} gave E_a for ionic migration (assumed by the authors to be Br⁻) very similar to that found via isotope tracer

studies in PbBr₂ (Figure 2 (ii)), i.e., ²⁴ and ²⁶ $\frac{kJ}{mol}$, respectively. For MAPbI₃, assuming I⁻ migration, $E_a \sim 35 - 41 \frac{kJ}{mol_{.16,17}}$ In those studies the authors *assumed* I⁻ migration to dominate.

- These three points fit the 'entropy' concept a statistically averaged situation, reflecting a collective xiii. energy state of a system that a 'slow' observer cannot observe.
- This can be, for example, a surface dipole, as systematically demonstrated by Zohar et al.¹⁸ to affect the xiv. Fermi level within an HaP layer. However, doping attempts with Bi³⁺, O₂ or I₂, showed only quite inefficient doping.^{19–21}
- An additional reason is very likely the presence of a heavy element. xv.
- "Forgiving" deposition processes, like 'spin-coating', result in polycrystalline films with high quality xvi. bulk material(with low static disorder as evidenced by narrow diffraction peaks).^{22,23} Further evidence

comes from the Urbach energy, E_U , which is small compared to that of other polycrystalline optoelectronic materials,²⁴ and especially, its temperature-independent part, an indicator for static disorder, which is ~ 60% less than that of high-quality single crystalline Si and GaAs.²⁵ Further discussion on E_U is in the main text.

- *xvii*. Motivated by the 'van Arkel-Ketelaar triangle'.²⁶
- *xviii.* Another possibility is formation of kinetically-stabilized bulky complexes that will require more time or energy to diffuse to the surface/ interfaces (e.g. complexes with large solvent molecules)²⁷.

References:

- 1. Brenner, T. M. et al. Are Mobilities in Hybrid Organic–Inorganic Halide Perovskites Actually "High"? J. Phys. Chem. Lett. 6, 4754–4757 (2015).
- 2. Herz, L. M. Charge-Carrier Mobilities in Metal Halide Perovskites: Fundamental Mechanisms and Limits. *ACS Energy Lett.* **2**, 1539–1548 (2017).
- 3. Sendner, M. *et al.* Optical phonons in methylammonium lead halide perovskites and implications for charge transport. *Mater. Horiz.* **3**, 613–620 (2016).
- 4. Senocrate, A. et al. Interaction of oxygen with halide perovskites. J. Mater. Chem. A 6, 10847-10855 (2018).
- 5. Ciccioli, A. & Latini, A. Thermodynamics and the Intrinsic Stability of Lead Halide Perovskites CH3NH3PbX3. J. *Phys. Chem. Lett.* **9**, 3756–3765 (2018).
- 6. Ivanov, I. L. *et al.* Thermodynamics of formation of hybrid perovskite-type methylammonium lead halides. *J. Chem. Thermodyn.* **116**, 253–258 (2018).
- 7. Haynes, W. M. CRC handbook of chemistry and physics: a ready-reference book of chemical and physical data. (2014).
- 8. Yi, C. *et al.* Entropic stabilization of mixed A-cation ABX3 metal halide perovskites for high performance perovskite solar cells. *Energy Environ. Sci.* **9**, 656–662 (2016).
- 9. Onoda-Yamamuro, N., Matsuo, T. & Suga, H. Calorimetric and IR spectroscopic studies of phase transitions in methylammonium trihalogenoplumbates (II)[†]. J. Phys. Chem. Solids **51**, 1383–1395 (1990).
- Michael Lufaso. Lecture notes: Defects and non stoichiometry; http://www.unf.edu/~michael.lufaso/chem4627/ch5_solid_state.pdf; Accessed :2018-06-02.
- 11. Souza, R. A. D., Islam, M. S. & Ivers-Tiffée, E. Formation and migration of cation defects in the perovskite oxide LaMnO 3. *J. Mater. Chem.* **9**, 1621–1627 (1999).
- 12. Rao, K. J. & Rao, C. N. R. Schottky Defects in Alkali Halides: Their Creation, Interaction, and Migration. *Phys. Status Solidi B* 28, 157–169 (1968).
- 13. Rakita, Y., Cohen, S. R., Kedem, N. K., Hodes, G. & Cahen, D. Mechanical properties of APbX 3 (A = Cs or CH3NH3; X = I or Br) perovskite single crystals. *MRS Commun.* **5**, 623–629 (2015).
- 14. Kuku, T. A., Chioba, E. R. & Chiodelli, G. Electrical properties of CuPbBr3. Solid State Ion. 34, 141–147 (1989).
- 15. Mizusaki, J., Arai, K. & Fueki, K. Ionic conduction of the perovskite-type halides. Solid State Ion. 11, 203-211 (1983).
- Futscher, M. H. *et al.* Quantification of Ion Migration in CH3NH3PbI3 Perovskite Solar Cells by Transient Capacitance Measurements. *ArXiv180108519 Cond-Mat* (2018).
- Yang, T.-Y., Gregori, G., Pellet, N., Grätzel, M. & Maier, J. The Significance of Ion Conduction in a Hybrid Organic– Inorganic Lead-Iodide-Based Perovskite Photosensitizer. *Angew. Chem.* 127, 8016–8021 (2015).
- Zohar, A. *et al.* What Limits the Open-Circuit Voltage of Bromide Perovskite-Based Solar Cells? *ACS Energy Lett.* 4, 1–7 (2019).
- 19. Zohar, A. *et al.* What Is the Mechanism of MAPbI3 p-Doping by I2? Insights from Optoelectronic Properties. *ACS Energy Lett.* **2**, 2408–2414 (2017).
- 20. Zohar, A. *et al.* Impedance Spectroscopic Indication for Solid State Electrochemical Reaction in (CH3NH3)PbI3 Films. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* **7**, 191–197 (2016).
- 21. Abdelhady, A. L. *et al.* Heterovalent Dopant Incorporation for Bandgap and Type Engineering of Perovskite Crystals. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* **7**, 295–301 (2016).
- 22. Miyadera, T. *et al.* Crystallization Dynamics of Organolead Halide Perovskite by Real-Time X-ray Diffraction. *Nano Lett.* **15**, 5630–5634 (2015).
- 23. Wang, B., Wong, K. Y., Yang, S. & Chen, T. Crystallinity and defect state engineering in organo-lead halide perovskite for high-efficiency solar cells. *J. Mater. Chem. A* **4**, 3806–3812 (2016).

- 24. De Wolf, S. *et al.* Organometallic Halide Perovskites: Sharp Optical Absorption Edge and Its Relation to Photovoltaic Performance. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* **5**, 1035–1039 (2014).
- 25. Ledinsky, M. *et al.* Temperature Dependence of the Urbach Energy in Lead Iodide Perovskites. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* **10**, 1368–1373 (2019).
- 26. Allen, L. C., Capitani, J. F., Kolks, G. A. & Sproul, G. D. Van Arkel-Ketelaar triangles. J. Mol. Struct. 300, 647-655 (1993).
- 27. Dang, Y., Ju, D., Wang, L. & Tao, X. Recent progress in the synthesis of hybrid halide perovskite single crystals. *CrystEngComm* 18, 4476–4484 (2016).