Supplementary information

Bioinorganic supplementation in calcium phosphate-based bone substitutes for improvement of biological performance: a systematic review and meta-analysis

Irene Lodoso-Torrecilla, Raquel Klein Gunnewiek, Eline-Claire Grosfeld, Rob B de Vries, Pamela Habibovi, John A Jansen, Jeroen JJP van den Beucken

Table S1: Literature search-strategy for PubMed		
("Bone regeneration"[Mesh] OR "Osteogenesis"[Mesh]		
Component 1: Bone regeneration	"Fracture healing" [Mesh] OR (Bone regeneration [Tiab]) OR	
	((Bone[Tiab]) AND (regeneration[Tiab])) OR	
	Osteogenesis[Tiab] OR (Fracture healing[Tiab]) OR	
	((Fracture[Tiab]) AND (Healing[Tiab])) (Bone	
	Formation[Tiab]) OR ((Bone[Tiab]) AND	
	(Formation[Tiab])) OR (Bone repair[Tiab]) OR	
	((Bone[Tiab]) AND (Repair[Tiab])) OR (Bone healing[Tiab])	
	OR ((Bone[Tiab]) AND (Healing[Tiab])) OR (new	
	bone[Tiab]) OR (new formed bone[Tiab]) OR (newly formed	
	bone[Tiab]) OR (bone forming[Tiab]) OR (formation of	
	bone[Tiab]) OR (formation of new bone[Tiab]))	
	("Bone Substitutes"[Mesh] OR "Bone Cements"[Mesh] OR	
	"Bone Transplantation"[Mesh] OR "Calcium	
	phosphates"[Mesh] OR Beta-tricalcium	
	Phosphate[Supplementary Concept] OR Alpha-tricalcium	
	Phosphate[Supplementary Concept] OR Tricalcium	
	Phosphate[Supplementary Concept] OR Bone	
	substitute*[Tiab] OR ((Bone[Tiab] OR Bones[Tiab]) AND	
Component 2: Bone substitutes	(Substitute[Tiab] OR Substitutes[Tiab])) OR	
	((Artificial[Tiab] OR Artificials[Tiab]) AND (Bone[Tiab]	
	OR Bones[Tiab])) OR ((Bone[Tiab] OR Bones [Tiab]) AND	
	(Replacement[Tiab] OR Replacements[Tiab])) OR	
	(Calcium[Tiab] AND Phosphate[Tiab]) OR Calcium	
	phosphate*[Tiab] OR CPC[Tiab] OR CPCs[Tiab] OR	
	((Bone[Tiab] OR Bones[Tiab]) AND (Cement[Tiab] OR	
	Cements[Tiab])) OR Tricalcium phosphate[Tiab] OR	
	Tricalcium phosphates[Tiab] OR Tricalcium	
	orthophosphate[Tiab] OR Tricalcium Diphosphate[Tiab] OR	
	ormophosphate[11a0] OK Theateruin Diphosphate[11a0] OK	

Table S1. Literature search-strategy for PubMed

	Tricalcium Phosphate Ceramic[Tiab] OR Beta-tricalciumPhosphate[Tiab] OR Calcium Superphosphate[Tiab] OR a-TCP[Tiab] OR b-TCP[Tiab] OR α-TCP[Tiab] OR β-		
	TCP[Tiab] OR alpha-TCP[Tiab] OR beta-TCP[Tiab] OR		
	alpha-tricalcium[Tiab] OR beta-tricalcium[Tiab] OR		
	tetracalcium phosphate[Tiab] OR TTCP[Tiab] OR Dicalcium		
	Phosphate[Tiab] OR DCPA[Tiab] OR hydroxyapatite*[Tiab]		
	OR Synthetic bone[Tiab])		
Component 3: Bioinorganics	("Copper"[Mesh] OR "Fluorides"[Mesh] OR		
	"Fluorine"[Mesh] OR "Magnesium"[Mesh] OR		
	"Silicon"[Mesh] OR "Silicates"[Mesh] OR		
	"Strontium"[Mesh] OR "Zinc"[Mesh] OR "Chlorine"[Mesh]		
	OR "Chlorides"[Mesh] OR "Sulfur"[Mesh] OR		
	"Sulfides"[Mesh] OR Inorganic*[Tiab] OR		
	Bioinorganic*[Tiab] OR Trace elements [Mesh] OR Trace		
	element*[Tiab] OR Copper[Tiab] OR Fluorine*[Tiab] OR		
	Fluoride*[Tiab] OR Magnesium[Tiab] OR Silicon[Tiab] OR		
	Silicate*[Tiab] OR Strontium[Tiab] OR Zinc[Tiab] OR		
	Chlorine[Tiab] OR Chlorite[Tiab] OR Chloride*[Tiab] OR		
	Sulfur[Tiab] OR Sulphur[Tiab] OR Sulfide*[Tiab] OR		
	Sulphide*[Tiab])		
Component 4: Animal studies	Search filter for animal studies [1]		

Table S2: Literature search-strategy for	or Embase
rable 52. Enterature scaren-strategy h	or Empase

Table 52. Electature search-strategy for Eline	exp bone defect/ OR exp bone regeneration/ OR exp bone
Component 1: Bone regeneration	development/ OR exp bone transplantation/ OR (bone
	regeneration OR fracture healing OR bone formation OR
	bone repair OR bone healing OR new bone OR new formed
	bone OR newly formed bone OR bone forming OR formation
	of bone OR formation of new bone).ti,ab.
	exp bone graft/ OR exp bone implant/ OR exp calcium
	phosphate/ OR exp bone cement/ OR exp bone cement
	device/ OR (bone substitute* OR bone cement* OR calcium
Component 2: Bone substitutes	phosphate* OR alpha tricalcium phosphate* OR bone
	transplantation OR tricalcium phosphate* OR beta tricalcium
	phosphate* OR artificial bone* OR bone replacement OR
	CPC* OR tricalcium orthophosphate* OR tricalcium
	diphosphate* OR tricalcium phosphate ceramic* OR calcium
	superphosphate* OR a-TCP OR b-TCP OR alpha-TCP OR
	beta-TCP OR tetracalcium OR TTCP OR dicalcium
	phosphate* OR DCPA OR hydroxyapatite OR synthetic
	bone).ti,ab.
Component 3: Bioinorganics	exp copper/ OR exp fluoride/ OR exp sulfur/ OR exp sulfide/
	OR exp fluorine/ OR exp magnesium/ OR exp silicon/ OR
	exp silicate/ OR exp strontium/ OR exp strontium 90/ OR exp
	zinc/ OR exp chlorine/ OR (inorganic* OR bioinorganic* OR
	trace element* OR copper OR fluoride* OR fluorine OR
	magnesium OR silicon OR silicate* OR strontium OR zinc
	OR chlorine OR chloride* OR sulphide* OR sulphur OR
	sulfide*).ti,ab.
Component 4: Animal studies	Search filter for animal studies[2]

Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria
- Primary research paper	- Not an original article
presenting pre-clinical animal	- Research paper presenting in
data (in vivo)	vitro data or clinical data
- Animals used should have	- Skeletally immature animals
reached the age of skeletal	
maturity	
- Data should be presented for	- No CaP-based bone substitute
animals that received a calcium	-No bioinorganics
phosphate based bone	- Multiple bioinorganics added
substitute with inclusion of one	to a calcium phosphate based
(not multiple) bioinorganic	bone substitute
element (i.e. Mg, Sr, Zn, F, Cu,	- No relevant control group
Si, S or Cl) (experimental	- No bone defect
group) vs. animals that received	
a calcium phosphate based	
bone substitute without	
inclusion of a bioinorganic	
element (control group)	
- Histological or	- Other outcome measures
(histo)morphometrical data	
about bone formation and/or	
material degradation should be	
presented	
	 Primary research paper presenting pre-clinical animal data (in vivo) Animals used should have reached the age of skeletal maturity Data should be presented for animals that received a calcium phosphate based bone substitute with inclusion of one (not multiple) bioinorganic element (i.e. Mg, Sr, Zn, F, Cu, Si, S or Cl) (experimental group) vs. animals that received a calcium phosphate based bone substitute without inclusion of a bioinorganic element (control group) Histological or (histo)morphometrical data about bone formation and/or material degradation should be

Table S3: Inclusion and exclusion criteria used for study selection

References

[1] C.R. Hooijmans, A. Tillema, M. Leenaars, M. Ritskes-Hoitinga, Enhancing search efficiency by means of a search filter for finding all studies on animal experimentation in PubMed, Laboratory animals 44(3) (2010) 170-5.

[2] R.B. de Vries, C.R. Hooijmans, A. Tillema, M. Leenaars, M. Ritskes-Hoitinga, Updated version of the Embase search filter for animal studies, Laboratory animals 48(1) (2014) 88.